



Queensland University of Technology  
Faculty of Law

# COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS OF OVERSEAS CONSUMER POLICY FRAMEWORKS

---

April 2016

Professor Stephen Corones (Research Co-Ordinator)

Professor Sharon Christensen

Professor Justin Malbon

Mr Allan Asher

Associate Professor Jeannie Marie Paterson

---

© Commonwealth of Australia 2016

ISBN 978-1-925220-95-7

This publication is available for your use under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia licence, with the exception of the Commonwealth Coat of Arms, the Treasury logo, photographs, images, signatures and where otherwise stated. The full licence terms are available from <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/3.0/au/legalcode>.



Use of Treasury material under a Creative Commons Attribution 3.0 Australia licence requires you to attribute the work (but not in any way that suggests that the Treasury endorses you or your use of the work).

*Treasury material used 'as supplied'.*

Provided you have not modified or transformed Treasury material in any way including, for example, by changing the Treasury text; calculating percentage changes; graphing or charting data; or deriving new statistics from published Treasury statistics — then Treasury prefers the following attribution:

*Source: The Australian Government the Treasury and Queensland University of Technology.*

#### **Derivative material**

If you have modified or transformed Treasury material, or derived new material from those of the Treasury in any way, then Treasury prefers the following attribution:

*Based on The Australian Government the Treasury and Queensland University of Technology data.*

#### **Use of the Coat of Arms**

The terms under which the Coat of Arms can be used are set out on the It's an Honour website (see [www.itsanhonour.gov.au](http://www.itsanhonour.gov.au)).

#### **Other uses**

Enquiries regarding this licence and any other use of this document are welcome at:

Manager  
Editorial, Media and Speeches Unit  
The Treasury  
Langton Crescent  
Parkes ACT 2600  
Email: [medialiaison@treasury.gov.au](mailto:medialiaison@treasury.gov.au)

# CONTENTS

<b>Part 1: Introduction</b> .....	<b>2-1</b>
1.1 Structure of the report .....	2-1
1.2 Consumer protection legislation in Australia .....	2-2
1.3 ACL as a National Uniform law .....	2-2
<b>Part 2: Executive summary</b> .....	<b>2-3</b>
2.1 Approaches to unconscionable or highly unfair trading practices.....	2-3
2.1.1 General and specific protections.....	2-3
2.2 Misleading conduct .....	2-5
2.3 Unfair/unconscionable conduct .....	2-5
2.4 Role of codes of conduct in unfair/unconscionable conduct.....	2-6
2.5 Unfair terms and the requirement of good faith .....	2-6
2.6 Inclusion of punitive fees in contracts.....	2-6
2.7 Pyramid schemes.....	2-7
2.8 Unsolicited selling and cooling off periods.....	2-7
2.9 Approaches to regulation of e-commerce and peer-to-peer transactions .....	2-7
2.9.1 Summary.....	2-7
2.9.2 Product quality .....	2-7
2.10 Unfair pricing .....	2-9
2.11 Fake reviews .....	2-10
2.12 Fraud.....	2-10
2.13 Peer-to-peer transactions .....	2-11
2.14 Institutional structures relating to the administration and enforcement of consumer laws.....	2-11
2.14.1 Summary and key observations .....	2-11
2.15 Jurisdictional comparisons .....	2-12
2.15.1 Comparison of main institutions for consumer protection.....	2-12
2.15.2 Legislation and jurisdictional comparisons .....	2-12
2.15.3 Comparative issues in policy and practice .....	2-13
2.16 The revised United Nations guidelines for consumer protection .....	2-13
2.17 United Nations sustainable development goals.....	2-13
2.18 Digital purchasing and digital products .....	2-14
2.19 Other interesting developments .....	2-14
2.20 Measures to facilitate access to justice.....	2-14
2.20.1 Summary.....	2-14

2.21	The form of and content of legislation.....	2-15
2.22	Information and education.....	2-16
2.23	Assistance and advice.....	2-16
2.24	Alternative dispute resolution.....	2-16
2.25	Regulatory oversight and enforcement.....	2-17
<b>Part 3:</b>	<b>Approaches to unconscionable or highly unfair trading practices .....</b>	<b>18</b>
3.1	Legislative approaches to regulating unconscionable or highly unfair trading practices .....	18
3.2	General protections in Australia.....	19
3.2.1	Introduction.....	19
3.2.2	General protections in Australia — misleading conduct.....	20
3.2.3	General protections in Australia — unconscionable conduct.....	21
3.2.4	Different interpretations of statutory unconscionable conduct.....	22
3.2.5	General protections in Australia — unfair terms .....	23
3.2.6	General protections in Australia — excluded terms .....	26
3.3	Punitive fees in contracts .....	28
3.3.1	Australia.....	28
3.3.2	Application of statutory unconscionable conduct to punitive fees .....	28
3.3.3	Application of unfair terms to punitive fees in contracts.....	29
3.3.4	Competition and Consumer Amendment (Payment Surcharges) Act 2015.....	30
3.3.5	European Union.....	31
3.3.6	General protection — punitive fees .....	32
3.3.7	Specific protection — punitive fees .....	34
3.4	United Kingdom.....	35
3.4.1	Introduction.....	35
3.4.2	General protection — punitive fees .....	36
3.4.3	Specific protection — punitive fees .....	37
3.5	United States .....	38
3.5.1	Introduction.....	38
3.5.2	General protection — punitive fees .....	39
3.5.3	Financial regulation .....	40
3.5.4	Industry Specific Regulation .....	41
3.6	Canada.....	41
3.6.1	Introduction.....	41
3.6.2	Banking Industry.....	41
3.7	Singapore.....	42
3.8	Pyramid selling .....	43
3.8.1	Australia.....	43
3.8.2	Specific protection — pyramid selling.....	43
3.8.3	Meaning of ‘pyramid scheme’ .....	44
3.8.4	Meaning of ‘entirely or substantially’ .....	45
3.8.5	Meaning of ‘in relation to’ .....	45
3.9	European Union.....	47
3.9.1	Introduction.....	47
3.9.2	General protection — pyramid selling .....	48
3.9.3	Specific protection — pyramid selling.....	49

3.10	United Kingdom.....	49
3.10.1	Introduction.....	49
3.10.2	General protection — pyramid selling .....	50
3.10.3	Specific protection — pyramid selling.....	51
3.11	United States of America.....	52
3.11.1	Introduction.....	52
3.11.2	General protection — pyramid selling .....	52
3.12	Canada .....	53
3.12.1	Introduction.....	53
3.12.2	Specific protection — pyramid selling.....	54
3.13	Singapore.....	55
3.13.1	Introduction.....	55
3.13.2	Specific protection — pyramid selling.....	55
3.14	Unsolicited selling laws.....	57
3.14.1	Australia.....	57
3.14.2	General protections — unsolicited selling laws .....	58
3.14.3	Specific protection — unsolicited selling .....	58
3.14.4	European Union.....	60
3.14.5	United Kingdom.....	62
3.14.6	General protection — unsolicited selling.....	63
3.14.7	Specific protection — unsolicited selling .....	65
3.14.8	United States .....	65
3.14.9	Canada .....	68
3.14.10	Singapore .....	69
3.15	Comparing and contrasting .....	71
3.15.1	Introduction.....	71
3.15.2	General protections.....	71
3.15.3	Misleading conduct: reasonable consumer v average consumer .....	72
3.15.4	Statutory unconscionable conduct v unfair commercial practice.....	74
3.15.5	Role for codes of conduct.....	75
3.15.6	Aggressive commercial practices .....	75
3.15.7	Unfair terms and the requirement of good faith .....	76
3.15.8	Inclusion of punitive fees in contracts.....	77
3.15.9	Pyramid Schemes: promoting retail sales over recruitment.....	78
3.15.10	Unsolicited selling and cooling off periods.....	79
<b>Part 4:</b>	<b>Approaches to regulation of e-commerce and peer to peer transactions.....</b>	<b>80</b>
4.1	Introduction — regulatory approaches to e-commerce .....	80
4.2	Product quality in e-commerce.....	81
4.2.1	Issues .....	81
4.2.2	Australia.....	83
4.2.3	United Kingdom.....	89
4.2.4	United States .....	92
4.2.5	Canada .....	95
4.2.6	Singapore.....	97
4.2.7	Comparison of regulatory approaches.....	98

4.3	Unfair or misleading pricing practices.....	99
4.3.1	Issues .....	99
4.3.2	Australia.....	101
4.3.3	United Kingdom.....	103
4.3.4	United States .....	106
4.3.5	Canada.....	109
4.3.6	Singapore.....	113
4.3.7	Comparison — Drip pricing and surge pricing in e-commerce.....	116
4.4	Online reviews and endorsements.....	117
4.4.1	Issues .....	117
4.4.2	Australia.....	119
4.4.3	United Kingdom.....	120
4.4.4	United States .....	122
4.4.5	Canada .....	125
4.4.6	Singapore.....	126
4.4.7	Comparison.....	127
4.5	Consumer fraud.....	128
4.5.1	Issues .....	128
4.5.2	Australia.....	130
4.5.3	United Kingdom.....	130
4.5.4	United States .....	131
4.5.5	Canada .....	133
4.5.6	Singapore.....	135
4.5.7	Comparison.....	136
4.6	Peer-to-peer transactions and the sharing economy.....	138
4.6.1	Overview.....	138
4.6.2	Peer to peer platforms — Scope of report.....	139
4.6.3	Consumer issues in peer to peer transactions .....	141
4.6.4	Australia.....	146
4.6.5	Other jurisdictions .....	148
4.6.6	Increased self-regulation.....	149
4.6.7	Comparison.....	149
<b>Part 5: Institutional structures relating to the administration and enforcement of consumer laws .....</b>		<b>150</b>
5.1	Introduction.....	150
5.2	Functions of consumer law enforcement and policy agencies .....	151
5.3	Country institutional structures for consumer law .....	152
5.4	Comparison of main institutions for consumer protection.....	153
5.4.1	United States .....	153
5.4.2	Canada .....	161
5.4.3	New Zealand .....	163
5.4.4	Singapore.....	163
5.4.5	United Kingdom.....	164
5.5	Legislation and jurisdictional comparisons .....	164
5.5.1	United States .....	164
5.5.2	Canada.....	166

5.5.3	New Zealand .....	166
5.5.4	Singapore .....	169
5.5.5	United Kingdom.....	171
5.6	Comparative issues in policy and practice .....	172
5.6.1	United States .....	172
5.6.2	Canada .....	173
5.6.3	New Zealand .....	174
5.6.4	Singapore .....	176
5.6.5	United Kingdom.....	178
5.7	Revised United Nations Guidelines for Consumer Protection .....	180
5.8	2030 UN Agenda for Sustainable Development.....	181
5.9	Digital purchasing and digital products .....	181
5.9.1	Obstacles to the Digital Single Market (2015).....	182
5.9.2	Key findings of the surveys.....	182
5.9.3	Types of purchases and online spending.....	183
5.9.4	Consumer attitudes and behaviour regarding online purchases .....	183
5.9.5	Perceived and actual barriers with online (cross-border) purchases.....	183
5.10	Other interesting developments .....	184
5.11	The European Consumer Centres Network (ECC-Net) .....	185
5.11.1	Operational information.....	185
5.11.2	Role and activities.....	186
5.11.3	Future challenges .....	186
5.11.4	Contacts and complaints .....	187
5.11.5	Research activity.....	187
5.11.6	Chargeback as a consumer protection tool.....	189
5.11.7	Other chargeback possibilities.....	191
5.12	Proposal for a Pan-European Trust Mark .....	192
5.12.1	Consumer trust in e-commerce.....	192
5.12.2	Trustmarks for e-commerce .....	193
5.12.3	Advantages and disadvantages of an EU Trustmark for e-commerce .....	193
5.12.4	26.4 Legal framework for e-commerce Trustmarks.....	194
5.12.5	An EU Trustmark for e-commerce.....	194
5.13	Best practices for all consumer redress .....	195
5.13.1	Objectives .....	196
5.13.2	The European e-Justice Portal .....	197
5.13.3	Consumer Conditions Scoreboard.....	198
5.13.4	Contribution of the Internal Market and consumer protection to growth.....	198
<b>Part 6:</b>	<b>MEASURES TO FACILITATE ACCESS TO JUSTICE.....</b>	<b>201</b>
6.1	Introduction.....	201
6.2	The form of and content of legislation.....	203
6.2.1	Australia.....	203
6.2.2	South Africa .....	204
6.3	Information and education.....	204
6.4	Information provided by regulators and consumer advocates.....	205
6.4.1	Australia.....	205
6.4.2	Canada .....	207

6.4.3	Singapore.....	208
6.4.4	South Africa.....	208
6.4.5	United Kingdom.....	208
6.5	Information via traders.....	209
6.5.1	Australia.....	209
6.5.2	Singapore.....	209
6.5.3	United Kingdom.....	209
6.6	Advice and assistance.....	210
6.6.1	Australia.....	210
6.6.2	Canada.....	211
6.6.3	Singapore.....	211
6.6.4	South Africa.....	211
6.6.5	United Kingdom.....	211
6.6.6	United States.....	212
6.7	Alternative dispute resolution.....	212
6.8	Tribunals and small claims courts.....	212
6.8.1	Australia.....	213
6.8.2	Singapore.....	214
6.8.3	South Africa.....	215
6.8.4	United Kingdom.....	215
6.8.5	Canada.....	215
6.8.6	United States.....	215
6.9	Mediation.....	216
6.10	Compulsory arbitration.....	216
6.10.1	Australia.....	216
6.10.2	United Kingdom.....	217
6.10.3	United States.....	217
6.11	Ombudsman services.....	217
6.11.1	Australia.....	218
6.11.2	South Africa.....	219
6.11.3	United Kingdom.....	220
6.12	Online dispute resolution.....	222
6.12.1	Canada (British Columbia).....	222
6.12.2	United Kingdom.....	223
6.13	Compliance and enforcement action by regulators.....	223
6.13.1	Australia.....	224
6.13.2	Canada.....	225
6.13.3	United Kingdom.....	226
6.13.4	Singapore.....	226
6.14	Comparison and analysis.....	226



# Part 1: Introduction

## 1.1 Structure of the report

The Commonwealth Department of Treasury (Commonwealth Treasury) on behalf of Consumer Affairs Australia and New Zealand (CAANZ) has engaged the Queensland University of Technology (QUT) to conduct a comparative review of international consumer policy frameworks.

The principal jurisdictions identified for the purposes of the comparison are the European Union, the United Kingdom, the United States of America, Canada, and Singapore.

This comparative analysis identifies emerging issues and key developments in consumer policy and possible alternative approaches for providing consumer protection. It highlights where the chosen jurisdictions adopt different approaches to Australia, but does not identify best practice models in other jurisdictions.

The following four principal issues are considered in this review:

### Issue 1: Approaches to unconscionable or highly unfair trading practices (Professor Stephen Corones, Faculty of Law, Queensland University of Technology)

The first issue for analysis is:

- Approaches to **unconscionable or highly unfair trading practices**:
  - **punitive fees** included in contracts that exceed the cost base (for example, regulating contract terms where transparency may not be enough);
  - the effectiveness of controls to limit **pyramid schemes**; and
  - the scope of **unsolicited selling laws** overseas and the approach to direct selling.

### Issue 2: Approaches to regulation of e-commerce and peer-to-peer transactions (Professor Sharon Christensen, Faculty of Law, Queensland University of Technology)

The second issue for analysis is:

- How consumer laws have responded to the challenges of **e-commerce and peer-to-peer transactions**:
  - online payments and disclosure of prices in online transactions e.g. drip pricing;
  - regulatory approaches that are flexible enough to accommodate technical solutions to the problem being regulated and not inhibit innovation or protect existing business models; and
  - challenges with obtaining a remedy for breaches of the law overseas/ international reach of domestic consumer protection laws.

### Issue 3: Institutional structures relating to the administration and enforcement of consumer laws

(Professor Justin Malbon, Faculty of Law, Monash University and Mr Allan Asher)

The third issue for analysis is:

- **Institutional structures** relating to the administration and enforcement of consumer laws (e.g. breadth of regulator powers; whether it is an enforcement model, administrative model or judicial model).

### Issue 4: Measures to facilitate access to justice

(Associate Professor Jeannie Marie Paterson, Melbourne Law School, University of Melbourne)

The fourth issue for analysis is:

- Measures to facilitate access to justice, including
  - early intervention and consumer empowerment,
  - support for consumers in accessing dispute resolution, and
  - institutional support (e.g. from regulators or other third party advocates).

The structure of the report is to consider each issue in a separate Part. Within each part the relevant Australian law that applies to the issue identified is considered. Next, the laws of the principal comparator jurisdictions applicable to the issue are considered. Finally, the respective laws are compared and contrasted and similarities and differences are identified.

## 1.2 Consumer protection legislation in Australia

Under the Australian Constitution, legislative power in relation to consumer protection is divided between the Commonwealth and the State and Territory parliaments. The method adopted to achieve this for the ACL was to use the ‘application model’. Under this model, new legislation to apply universally throughout Australia is enacted by a lead legislator — in this case the Commonwealth, with the text of the ACL set out in Sch 2 of the *Competition and Consumer Act 2010* (Cth) (CCA). This text is made the law of the Commonwealth and of each State and Territory law by their individual applications laws — laws that apply the Schedule within each particular jurisdiction.

Although the principal provisions of the ACL only came into effect on 1 January 2011, many of these provisions are not novel. Instead, they are based on the consumer protection provisions of the *Trade Practices Act 1974* (Cth) (TPA), albeit in revised language. Other provisions, of the ACL are new at the Commonwealth level, but they have been modelled on provisions previously contained in State, Territory, or overseas legislation.

## 1.3 ACL as a National Uniform law

In the case of the Commonwealth, the application law is contained in Pt XI of the CCA. This restricts the application of Sch 2 by reference to the limits imposed on Commonwealth legislative power by the Australian Constitution and by reference to the policy decision to leave the regulation of financial services and products to the *Australian Securities and Investments Commission Act 2011* (Cth) (ASIC Act).

Section 131(1) of the CCA applies Sch 2 as a law of the Commonwealth only to ‘the conduct of corporations, and in relation to contravention of Chapters 2, 3 or 4 of Schedule 2 by corporations.’